

BOOK XVI

LIBER SEXTUS DECIMUS

I

Verba Musoni philosophi Graeca, digna atque utilia audiri observarique ; eiusdemque utilitatis sententia a M. Catone multis ante annis Numantiae ad equites dicta.

- 1 ADULESCENTULI cum etiamtum in scholis essemus, ἐνθυμημάτιον hoc Graecum quod adposui dictum esse a Musonio philosopho audiebamus et, quoniam vere atque luculente dictum verbisque est brevibus et rotundis vinctum, perquam libenter memineramur :
- 2 Ἄν τι πράξης καλὸν μετὰ πόνου, ὁ μὲν πόνος οἴχεται, τὸ δὲ καλὸν μένει· ἂν τι ποιήσης αἰσχρὸν μετὰ ἡδονῆς, τὸ μὲν ἡδὺ οἴχεται, τὸ δὲ αἰσχρὸν μένει.
- 3 Postea istam ipsam sententiam in Catonis oratione, quam dixit *Numantiae apud Equites*, positam legimus. Quae etsi laxioribus paulo longioribusque verbis comprehensa est praequam illud Graecum quod diximus, quoniam tamen prior tempore anti-
- 4 quiorque est, venerabilior videri debet. Verba ex oratione haec sunt : “ Cogitate cum animis vestris, si quid vos per laborem recte feceritis, labor ille a vobis cito recedet, bene factum a vobis, dum vivitis, non abscedet ; sed si qua per voluptatem nequiter feceritis, voluptas cito abibit, nequiter factum illud apud vos semper manebit.”

¹ p. 273, Peerlkamp.

BOOK XVI

I

A saying of Musonius, the Greek philosopher, which is of practical value and worth hearing and bearing in mind; and a remark of equal value made by Marcus Cato many years before to the knights at Numantia.

WHEN I was still young and a schoolboy, I heard that this Greek sentiment which I have subjoined was uttered by the philosopher Musonius, and since it is a true and brilliant saying, expressed briefly and roundly, I very willingly committed it to memory: ¹ "If you accomplish anything noble with toil, the toil passes, but the noble deed endures. If you do anything shameful with pleasure, the pleasure passes, but the shame endures."

Later, I read that same sentiment in the speech of Marcus Cato which he delivered *At Numantia to the Knights*. Although it is expressed somewhat loosely and diffusely compared with the Greek which I have given, yet, since it is prior in time and more ancient, it ought to seem worthy of greater respect. The words in the speech are as follows: ² "Bear in mind, that if through toil you accomplish a good deed, that toil will quickly pass from you, the good deed will not leave you so long as you live; but if through pleasure you do anything dishonourable, the pleasure will quickly pass away, that dishonourable act will remain with you for ever."

² p. 38, 11, Jordan.

ATTIC NIGHTS OF AULUS GELLIUS

II

Cuiusmodi sit lex apud dialecticos percontandi disserendique ;
et quae sit eius legis reprehensio.

1 LEGEM esse aiunt disciplinae dialecticae, si de
quapiam re quaeratur disputeturque atque ibi quid
rogere ut respondeas, tum ne amplius quid dicas
quam id solum quod es rogatus aut aias aut neges ;
eamque legem qui non servent, et aut plus aut aliter
quam sunt rogati respondeant, existumantur indoc-
2 tique¹ esse disputandique morem atque rationem
non tenere. Hoc quidem quod dicunt in plerisque
3 disputationibus procul dubio fieri oportet. Inde-
finitus namque inexplicabilisque sermo fiet, nisi
interrogationibus responsionibusque simplicibus fuerit
determinatus.

4 Sed enim esse quaedam videntur, in quibus si
breviter et ad id quod rogatus fueris respondeas,
5 capiare. Nam si quis his verbis interroget : " Postulo
uti respondeas desierisne facere adulterium an non,"
utrumcumque dialectica lege responderis, sive aias seu
neges, haerebis in captione, tamquam si te dicas adul-
6 terum quam si neges ;² nam qui facere non desinit,
7 non id necessario etiam fecit. Falsa igitur est
species istius captionis et nequaquam procedere ad
id potest, ut conligi concludique possit eum facere
8 adulterium qui se negaverit facere desisse. Quid
autem legis istius propugnatores in illa captiuncula
facient, in qua haerere eos necessum est, si nihil
amplius quam quod interrogati erunt responderint ?

¹ indoctique, *QZON* ; indocti, *IIQ*² ; rudes indoctique *N*² ;
indocti inscitique, *sugg. by Hosius (cf. xix. 8. 12).*

² tam . . . neges, σ ; tamquam si te dicas adulterium
. . . negent, *MSS.*

II

The nature of the rule of the logicians in disputation and declamation, and the defect of that rule.

THEY say that it is a rule of the dialectic art, that if there is inquiry and discussion of any subject, and you are called upon to answer a question which is asked, you should answer the question by a simple "yes" or "no." And those who do not observe that rule, but answer more than they were asked, or differently, are thought to be both uneducated and unobservant of the customs and laws of debate. As a matter of fact this dictum undoubtedly ought to be followed in very many debates. For a discussion will become endless and hopelessly involved, unless it is confined to simple questions and answers.

But there seem to be some discussions in which, if you answer what you are asked briefly and directly, you are caught in a trap. For if anyone should put a question in these words: "I ask you to tell me whether you have given up committing adultery or not," whichever way you answer according to this rule of debate, whether you say "yes" or "no," you will be caught in a dilemma, equally if you should say that you are an adulterer, or should deny it; for one who has not given up a thing has not of necessity ever done it. That then is a deceptive kind of catch-question, and can by no means lead to the inference and conclusion that he commits adultery who says that he has not given up doing it. But what will the defenders of that rule do in that dilemma, in which they must necessarily be caught, if they give a simple answer to the question? For

ATTIC NIGHTS OF AULUS GELLIUS

- 9 Nam, si ita ego istorum aliquem rogem : “ Quicquid non perdidisti habeasne an non habeas postulo ut aias aut neges,” utrumcumque breviter responderit, 10 capietur. Nam si habere¹ se negaverit quod non perdidit, colligetur oculos eum non habere, quos non perdidit; sin vero habere se dixerit, colligetur 11 habere eum cornua, quae non perdidit. Rectius igitur cautiusque ita respondebitur: “ Quicquid 12 habui, id habeo, si id non perdidit.” Sed huiusce- modi responsio non fit ex ea lege quam diximus; plus enim, quam quod rogatus est, respondet. 13 Propterea id quoque ad eam legem addi solet, non esse captiosis interrogationibus respondendum.

III

Quanam ratione effici dixerit Erasistratus medicus, si cibus forte deerit, ut tolerari aliquantisper inedia possit et tolerari fames; verbaque ipsa Erasistrati super ea re scripta.

- 1 Cum Favorino Romae dies plerumque totos eramus tenebatque animos nostros homo ille fandi dulcissimus atque eum, quoquo iret, quasi ex lingua prorsum eius capti² prosequeremur; ita sermonibus 2 usquequaque amoenissimis demulcebat. Tum ad quendam aegrum cum isset visere nosque cum eo una introissemus multaque ad medicos, qui tum forte istic erant, valitudinis eius gratia oratione Graeca dixisset, “ Ac ne hoc quidem mirum,” inquit, “ videri debet, quod, cum antehac semper edundi

¹ si non habere, *ω*; non *deleted by Gruppe*.

if I should ask any one of them: "Do you, or do you not, have what you have not lost? I demand the answer 'yes' or no," whichever way he replies briefly, he will be caught. For if he says that he does not have what he has not lost, the conclusion will be drawn that he has no eyes, since he has not lost them; but if he says that he has it, it will be concluded that he has horns, because he has not lost them. Therefore it will be more cautious and more correct to reply as follows: "I have whatever I had, if I have not lost it." But an answer of that kind is not made in accordance with the rule which we have mentioned; for more is answered than was asked. Therefore this proviso also is commonly added to the rule, that one need not answer catch-questions.

III

By what means Erasistratus, the physician, said that one could do for a time without eating, if food chanced to be lacking, and endure hunger; and his own words on that subject.

I OFTEN spent whole days in Rome with Favorinus. His delightful conversation held my mind enthralled, and I attended him wherever he went, as if actually taken prisoner by his eloquence; to such a degree did he constantly delight me with his most agreeable discourse. Once when he had gone to visit a sick man, and I had entered with him, having conversed for some time in Greek about the man's illness with the physicians who chanced to be there at the time, he said: "This ought not to seem surprising either, that although previously he was always

² apti, *Stephanus*.

END OF SAMPLE TEXT



The Complete Text can be found on our CD:
Primary Literary Sources For Ancient Literature
which can be purchased on our Website :
www.Brainfly.net

or

by sending **\$64.95** in check or money order to :
Brainfly Inc.
5100 Garfield Ave. #46
Sacramento CA 95841-3839

TEACHER'S DISCOUNT:

If you are a **TEACHER** you can take advantage of our teacher's discount. Click on **Teachers Discount** on our website (www.Brainfly.net) or **Send us \$55.95** and we will send you a full copy of *Primary Literary Sources For Ancient Literature* **AND** our *5000 Classics CD (a collection of over 5000 classic works of literature in electronic format (.txt))* plus our *Wholesale price list*.

If you have any suggestions such as books you would like to see added to the collection or if you would like our wholesale prices list please send us an email to:

webcomments@brainfly.net